

1 JONATHAN M. COUPAL, State Bar No. 107815  
TREVOR A. GRIMM, State Bar No. 34258  
2 TIMOTHY A. BITTLE, State Bar No. 112300  
LAURA E. MURRAY, State Bar No. 255855  
3 Howard Jarvis Taxpayers Foundation  
921 Eleventh Street, Suite 1201  
4 Sacramento, CA 95814  
Phone: (916) 444-9950  
5 Email: tim@hjta.org

6 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

HOWARD JARVIS TAXPAYERS ASSN.; )  
LINNEA WARREN; THOMAS WOLFE; )  
EDWARD HENRY; AND ALL OTHERS )  
SIMILARLY SITUATED, )  
Plaintiffs, )  
v. )  
CITY OF PASADENA, )  
Defendant. )

Case No. BC550394

**DECLARATION OF THOMAS HILTACHK  
IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR  
ATTORNEY FEES**

Date: October 11, 2018  
Time: 11:00 a.m.  
Dept: 6

1 I, Thomas W. Hiltachk, declare as follows:

2 I am an attorney, duly licensed by the State of California and admitted to practice before  
3 this Court. I can competently testify as to the matters contained in this declaration, all of which  
4 are within my personal knowledge, and if called upon as a witness, my testimony would be the  
5 same.

6 I am a partner in the law firm of Bell, McAndrews and Hiltachk, LLP. I have been  
7 practicing law since 1987. I am a member and former president of the California Political  
8 Attorneys Association. My law practice includes the fields of public finance, election law, and  
9 California taxation, particularly the taxation and assessment of real property.

10 I am knowledgeable about the salary and billing rates customarily charged by counsel  
11 who practice this area of law in the greater Sacramento and East Bay region.

12 I have reviewed the experience and qualifications of Jonathan Coupal and Timothy  
13 Bittle. According to his resume, Mr. Coupal has been practicing law since 1982. He was an  
14 attorney with the Pacific Legal Foundation for 10 years before he took a position as the Director  
15 of Legal Affairs for the Howard Jarvis Taxpayers Association. In 1999, Mr. Coupal was  
16 selected by the Association's board of trustees to assume the office of President. Mr. Coupal  
17 has litigated many landmark public finance cases, including *Legislature v. Eu*, (1991) 54 Cal.3d  
18 492, *Nordlinger v. Hahn* (1992) 505 U.S. 1, *Santa Clara County Trans. Auth. v. Guardino*  
19 (1995) 11 Cal.4th 220, and *Consolidated Fire Protection Dist. of L.A. v. Howard Jarvis*  
20 *Taxpayers Assn.* (1998) 63 Cal.App.4th 211. In my opinion, the hourly rate of \$700 per hour  
21 for an attorney with Mr. Coupal's experience, when performing litigation services that result in  
22 a favorable decision, is reasonable.


23 Timothy Bittle has been practicing law since 1983. He too started his career as an  
24 attorney with the Pacific Legal Foundation. In 1992 he became General Counsel of a large  
25 mining and development company. In 1996 he was retained as a consultant for the State  
26 Assembly. When Mr. Coupal was promoted to President of Howard Jarvis Taxpayers  
27 Association, Mr. Bittle took over as the Association's new Director of Legal Affairs. Mr. Bittle  
28 has also litigated his share of landmark cases, including *Nollan v. California Coastal*

1 *Commission* (1987) 483 U.S. 825, *Howard Jarvis Taxpayers Assn. v. City of La Habra* (2001)  
2 25 Cal.4th 809, *Howard Jarvis Taxpayers Assn. v. City of Roseville* (2002) 97 Cal.App.4th 637,  
3 *Howard Jarvis Taxpayers Assn. v. County of Orange* (2003) 110 Cal.App.4th 1375, *Howard*  
4 *Jarvis Taxpayers Assn. v. City of Fresno* (2005) 127 Cal.App.4th 914, *Silicon Valley Taxpayers*  
5 *Assn. v. Santa Clara County Open Space Authority* (2008) 44 Cal.4th 431, *Howard Jarvis*  
6 *Taxpayers Assn. v. Bowen* (2011) 192 Cal.App.4th 110, and *San Diego County Employees*  
7 *Retirement Assn. v. Superior Court* (2011) 196 Cal.App.4th 1228.

8 In my opinion, the hourly rate of \$700 per hour for an attorney with Mr. Bittle's  
9 experience, when performing litigation services that result in a favorable decision, is also very  
10 reasonable.

11 I certify upon penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct and that this  
12 declaration was executed on the date shown below in the City of Sacramento, California.

13 DATED: August 9, 2018

14   
15 \_\_\_\_\_  
16 THOMAS W. HILTACHK  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28