

1 JONATHAN M. COUPAL, State Bar No. 107815
TREVOR A. GRIMM, State Bar No. 34258
2 TIMOTHY A. BITTLE, State Bar No. 112300
LAURA E. MURRAY, State Bar No. 255855
3 Howard Jarvis Taxpayers Foundation
921 Eleventh Street, Suite 1201
4 Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (916) 444-9950
5 Email: tim@hjta.org

6 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

HOWARD JARVIS TAXPAYERS ASSN.;)
LINNEA WARREN; THOMAS WOLFE;)
EDWARD HENRY; AND ALL OTHERS)
SIMILARLY SITUATED,)
Plaintiffs,)
v.)
CITY OF PASADENA,)
Defendant.)

Case No. BC550394

**DECLARATION OF TIMOTHY BITTLE IN
SUPPORT OF FINAL APPROVAL OF
CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT**

Date: October 11, 2018
Time: 11:00 a.m.
Dept: 6

1 multiplier. The City accepted the number of hours, but asked that the hourly rate of the two
2 most experienced attorneys, including myself, be reduced by \$100/hour. We accepted the
3 City's counter-offer. If the case had gone to trial and the court had awarded refunds, I
4 would have sought a multiplier or a fee based on a percentage of the fund from which
5 refunds would be paid. That fee amount would have been significantly greater than the
6 hourly compensation agreed to here.

7 3. Counsel for both parties in this case have relevant experience. The City's
8 lawyer, Holly Whatley, is a partner in the law firm Colantuono, Highsmith & Whatley
9 (CH&W). I have litigated several Proposition 218 cases where CH&W was either counsel of
10 record or amicus curiae. I have been a presenter on several Proposition 218 panels where
11 a CH&W partner was also a presenter. I have great respect for the firm and consider them
12 experts on Proposition 218. As for me, I am the Director of Legal Affairs for the Howard
13 Jarvis Taxpayers Association, which authored and sponsored Proposition 218 and whose
14 core mission includes acting as a "watchdog" to protect the rights of California taxpayers. I
15 have held this position for over 20 years. I too have been counsel of record or amicus
16 curiae on dozens of cases involving Proposition 218, including at least four class actions. In
17 my opinion, the present settlement is fair, reasonable and adequate and in the best interest
18 of the Class members.

19 I certify upon penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the
20 foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed August 14, 2018, in the
21 City of Sacramento, California.

22 
23 _____
24 TIMOTHY A. BITTLE
25
26
27
28